
CONTENTS

Introduction	1
CHAPTER 1	
<i>Brady</i> Information	13
A. The Supreme Court Cases	14
1. <i>Brady v. Maryland</i> (1963): Evidence Favorable to the Defense and Material to Either Guilt or Punishment Must Be Disclosed	14
2. <i>Giglio v. United States</i> (1972): Evidence Affecting Credibility Falls Within the <i>Brady</i> Rule	16
3. <i>United States v. Agurs</i> (1976): The Government’s Failure to Disclose Immaterial Information Will Not Lead to Reversal	17
4. <i>United States v. Bagley</i> (1985): Material Undisclosed Evidence Is Evidence that Undermines Confidence in the Outcome of the Trial	20
5. <i>Kyles v. Whitley</i> (1995): The Court Refines the Materiality Standard and Applies It in a Fact-Intensive Analysis	22
6. <i>Brady</i> in the Supreme Court Since <i>Kyles</i>	25
7. <i>Youngblood v. West Virginia</i> (2006): Summarizing <i>Brady</i> Law	28
B. The Three Elements of a <i>Brady</i> Violation	29
1. Favorable to the Accused	29

a. “Exculpatory” information versus “impeachment” information.	30
b. “ <i>Brady</i> material” versus “ <i>Brady</i> information.”	31
c. Inadmissible evidence may be producible under <i>Brady</i> .	31
2. Suppression by the Government	33
3. Prejudice to the Defendant: Has Confidence in the Outcome of the Trial Been Undermined?	34
a. Evidence found to be material.	35
b. Evidence found not to be material.	37
c. “Cumulative” evidence.	39
C. Other Considerations Regarding What Must Be Produced	40
1. <i>Brady</i> Does Not Require Open File Discovery	40
2. Prosecutors’ Work Product	40
3. Confidential Informants	42
D. The <i>Brady</i> Rule at the Trial Court Level	42
E. Common Procedural Considerations	45
1. Timing of <i>Brady</i> Disclosures	45
2. Form of <i>Brady</i> Disclosures	48
3. In Camera Review of Potential <i>Brady</i> Information	50
4. Identifying Material Exculpatory Information Within a Larger Production	51
5. Disclosing <i>Brady</i> Information Before a Guilty Plea	52

CHAPTER 2

Rule 16 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure	55
A. Discovery Available from the Government	59
1. Requests by the Defense	59
a. Form and specificity of the request.	60
b. Withdrawing the request.	61
c. Requests in a multi-defendant case.	62
2. Rule 16(a)—Defendant’s Statements—Generally	62
a. Defendant must request the statement.	63
b. Meaning of “statement.”	63
c. Method of producing statements.	65
3. Rule 16(a)(1)(A)—Defendant’s Oral Statements	65
a. “Oral” statement.	66
b. “Substance of the statement.”	67
c. Relevance.	67
d. Statement made by the defendant.	68

e.	Before or after arrest.	69
f.	Statement made to a known government agent in response to interrogation.	69
g.	Government's intent to use the statement at trial.	71
4.	Rule 16(a)(1)(B)—Defendant's Written or Recorded Statements	72
a.	Written or recorded statement by the defendant.	74
i.	Relevance	74
ii.	"Written or recorded statement"	75
iii.	Government's possession, custody, or control	76
iv.	Knowledge or "due diligence"	80
b.	Written record containing the substance of the defendant's statement in response to interrogation by a known government agent.	81
c.	The defendant's grand jury testimony.	83
5.	Rule 16(a)(1)(C)—Organizational Defendants	84
6.	Defendant's Prior Criminal Record	86
7.	Documents and Objects	89
a.	Threshold requirements.	89
i.	Writings or tangible things	89
ii.	Government's "possession, custody, or control"	91
b.	Categories of discoverable documents and objects.	92
i.	Items "material to preparing the defense"	92
(a)	<i>United States v. Armstrong</i>	92
(b)	Meaning of "material"	94
(c)	Defendant's request	97
(d)	Burden to show materiality	97
(e)	Material buildings or places	100
ii.	Documents to be used in the government's case-in-chief	100
(a)	Obligation to specify documents for use at trial	100
(b)	Government's case-in-chief	103
(c)	Government's intent	103
(d)	"Use"	104
iii.	Defendant's documents	106
c.	Inspection and copying.	107
8.	Reports of Examinations and Tests	111
a.	Covered examinations, tests, and experiments.	112
b.	"Results or reports."	113
c.	Conditions for disclosure.	115
d.	Other considerations.	116

9. Expert Witnesses	116
a. Conditions for disclosure.	117
i. Defendant’s request	117
ii. Government’s intent to use during case-in-chief	118
iii. Expert testimony versus lay or fact testimony	119
b. The “written summary.”	122
i. Summary of opinions and their bases and reasons	123
ii. Statement of the witness’s qualifications	126
iii. Method of production	127
c. Reciprocal expert discovery regarding defendant’s mental condition.	128
B. Express Limitations on Discovery from the Government	129
1. The Work-Product Exception	131
a. Common law work-product protection in criminal cases.	131
b. Scope of immunity for “work product” under Rule 16(a)(2).	133
c. Waiving and overcoming work-product protection.	136
d. Privileges and redactions.	138
2. Witness Statements	140
3. Grand Jury Transcripts	141
C. Discovery Available from the Defendant	142
1. Constitutional and Fairness Considerations	142
2. The 1975 Amendments to Rule 16	144
3. Defendant’s Request for Discovery and Government’s Compliance	146
4. Timing of Reciprocal Discovery	149
5. Documents and Objects to Be Used at Trial	150
a. Documents for use in defendant’s case-in-chief.	151
b. Documents and tangible things.	152
c. Defendant’s possession, custody, or control.	153
d. Defendant’s “intent.”	153
6. Reports of Examinations and Tests	156
7. Expert Witnesses	159
D. Express Limitations on Discovery from the Defendant	162
1. Comparison with Subsection (a)(2)	163
2. Exception for Scientific and Medical Reports	164
3. Documents Made by the Defendant or the Defendant’s Agent During the Investigation or Defense	165
4. Statements to the Defendant or the Defendant’s Agent	167

E. Continuing Duties of Disclosure, and Court Oversight	170
1. Continuing Duty to Supplement Disclosure	170
2. The District Court’s Authority to Regulate Discovery	174
a. Protective and modifying orders.	175
i. Good cause	176
ii. Ex parte showings	177
iii. District court’s discretion under Rule 16(d)(1)	178
b. Remediating Rule 16 violations.	182
i. Available remedies	183
ii. Punitive remedies	186

CHAPTER 3

Witness Statements	189
A. History of the Jencks Act	190
1. <i>Jencks v. United States</i>	190
2. Congress’s Response—18 U.S.C. § 3500	192
3. Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 26.2	194
B. Disclosures Required Under Rule 26.2 and the Jencks Act	197
1. Meaning of “Statement”	198
a. Written statements made and signed, adopted, or approved by the witness.	198
b. Substantially verbatim records contained in a recording or transcription.	203
c. Statements to a grand jury.	204
2. Additional Limitations on Discoverability of Statements	204
a. Statement of the witness.	205
b. Statements that relate to the subject matter of the witness’s testimony.	206
c. Possession of statements.	206
C. Timing of Jencks Disclosures, and Motions to Produce	207
1. Timing of Disclosures	207
2. Motions to Produce Statements	210
D. Procedural Considerations	211
1. Adjudicating Disputes About Whether Material May Be Discoverable	211
2. Producing Portions of Documents	212
E. Sanctions for Failing to Produce a Statement	213
F. Interaction Between <i>Jencks</i> and <i>Brady</i>	215

CHAPTER 4

Subpoenas for Documents	217
A. Standards for Obtaining Documents by Subpoena	219
1. <i>Bowman Dairy</i>	221
2. <i>Nixon</i>	223
3. Applying the <i>Nixon</i> Test	226
a. Relevancy.	226
b. Admissibility.	227
i. Standards for “admissibility”	227
ii. Contingent admissibility: the problem of impeachment evidence	229
iii. Other “admissibility” issues	231
c. Specificity.	232
d. Burden on the subpoena recipient.	234
e. Subpoenas returnable pretrial.	235
f. Other restrictions on Rule 17(c) subpoenas.	238
4. Limits of the <i>Nixon</i> Test	239
a. Should the <i>Nixon</i> test apply to third-party subpoenas?	240
b. Should the <i>Nixon</i> test apply to subpoenas for evidence material to the defense?	241
B. Obtaining or Challenging a Subpoena	243
1. Obtaining a Pretrial Subpoena	244
a. Motion required.	244
b. Procedure on motion; ex parte motions.	245
2. Obtaining a Trial Subpoena	247
a. No motion required.	247
b. Rule 17(c)(3).	247
c. Subpoenas directed to lawyers.	249
3. Motions to Quash or Modify Subpoenas	250
a. Standards and procedures for motions to quash or modify.	250
b. Materials considered; in camera review.	251
c. “Modifying” a subpoena.	252
d. Standing to challenge subpoenas.	253
C. Return of Subpoena	254
D. Logistical Matters	256
1. Form and Service of Subpoenas	256
2. Subpoena Expenses and Cost-Shifting	259

CHAPTER 5**Other Federal Rules and Statutes Permitting
or Requiring Discovery****261**

A. Notice of Alibi: Rule 12.1	262
1. Historical Context	262
2. Requirements of Rule 12.1	264
a. Government request for notice of alibi defense.	264
b. Defense obligation.	264
c. Government reciprocal obligation.	265
d. Continuing duty to disclose new information, and exceptions to the rule.	266
e. Inadmissibility of notice of alibi defense.	266
3. Exclusion of Witnesses	266
a. Generally.	266
b. Exclusion of witnesses for government noncompliance.	267
c. Exclusion of witnesses for defense noncompliance.	268
d. Newly discovered witnesses.	269
B. Notice of Insanity Defense: Rule 12.2	269
1. Historical Context	269
2. Requirements of Rule 12.2	270
a. Defense obligation to notify of insanity defense.	270
b. Defense obligation to notify of expert evidence of mental condition.	270
c. Mental examinations.	271
d. Inadmissibility of mental condition notice and statements during mental examination.	271
3. Sanctions for Noncompliance	274
C. Notice of Public Authority Defense: Rule 12.3	275
1. Historical Context	275
2. Requirements of the Rule	275
a. Defense obligation.	275
b. Government obligation.	276
c. Continuing duty and additional time.	276
d. Inadmissibility of withdrawn intention.	276
3. Sanctions for Noncompliance	277
D. Notice of Evidence the Government Intends to Use in Its Case-in-Chief: Rule 12(b)(4)(B)	277
E. Depositions: Rule 15	279
1. Unavailability of the Witness	282
2. Materiality of the Testimony	286

3. Other Factors	287
4. Depositions by Consent	289
F. Grand Jury Material: Rule 6(e)	289
1. Scope of Grand Jury Secrecy	290
a. Matters occurring before the grand jury.	290
b. Limits of grand jury secrecy.	291
2. Means of Obtaining Material Under Rule 6(e)	292
a. Rules 16 and 26.2 (Jencks).	292
b. Disclosure under Rule 6(e)(3)(E).	293
3. “Particularized Need”	293
4. Disclosure “Preliminary to or in Connection with a Judicial Proceeding”	295
5. Disclosure to Support a Claim that the Indictment Should Be Dismissed	297
G. Disclosure Under Evidence Rule 404(B) and Other Federal Rules of Evidence	300
1. Other Crimes, Wrongs, or Acts: Rule 404(b)	300
2. Other Evidence Rules	304
a. Past sexual behavior: Rule 412.	304
b. Convictions more than ten years old: Rule 609.	304
c. Writings used to refresh memory: Rule 612.	305
d. Residual exception to the hearsay rule: Rule 807.	308
e. Summary charts: Rule 1006.	308
H. Title III—Electronic Surveillance	310
1. Disclosing the Surveillance “Inventory”	310
2. Disclosing Electronic Surveillance and the Application for and Court Order Approving the Electronic Surveillance	312
I. The Freedom of Information Act	314
1. Exemptions from Disclosure	315
2. Timing	317
3. Using FOIA to Obtain Records	318

CHAPTER 6

Inherent Authority of the Court **321**

A. The Basis for Inherent Authority	322
1. Inherent Authority Generally	322

2. Inherent Authority as Applied to Criminal Discovery	323
3. Scope and Limits of Inherent Authority	326
B. Witness Lists	331
1. Witness Lists Under the Federal Rules	332
2. Inherent Authority to Order Disclosure of Witnesses	334
a. Court may apply a balancing test.	334
b. List limited to case-in-chief witnesses.	336
c. Government requests for defense witness lists.	336
C. Confidential Informants	338
1. <i>Roviaro v. United States</i>	338
2. Applying <i>Roviaro</i> 's Balancing Test	340
a. Degree to which the confidential informant was involved in the alleged conduct giving rise to the indictment.	341
b. Whether the informant has information that supports the defense.	342
c. Government's interest in withholding the informant's identity.	342
3. Making the Informant Available to the Defense	343
D. Physical Identifying Evidence of the Defendant: Handwriting Exemplars, Voiceprints, and Fingerprints	345

CHAPTER 7

Discovery Obligations Under Ethical Rules	349
A. Rule 3.8(d) Applies to Federal Prosecutors Practicing in States That Have Adopted It	350
B. Information Favorable to the Defense: ABA's Model Rule of Professional Conduct 3.8(d)	351
C. Rule 3.8(d) in the States	355

CHAPTER 8

Department of Justice Criminal Discovery Policies	359
A. <i>U.S. Attorneys' Manual</i>	360
1. What Must Be Disclosed	360
2. Where to Look	361
3. Timing	363
4. Enforcement	364

B. Department of Justice’s 2010 Discovery Guidance	364
1. Gathering and Reviewing Discoverable Information	366
a. Where to look.	366
b. What to review.	367
2. Conducting the Review	368
3. Making the Disclosure	368
4. Making the Record	369

CHAPTER 9

Special Considerations: Witness Safety and National Security	371
A. Witness Safety	371
1. Rule 16(d)(1) Protective Orders	371
2. Confidential Informants	372
B. National Security: The Classified Information Procedures Act	373
1. Purpose of CIPA	373
2. What Information Is Confidential	374
3. Pretrial Conferences	374
4. Procedure for Protective Orders	375
5. Standard for Restricting Discovery of Classified Material	375
6. Defendant’s Notice of Intent to Use Classified Information	379
7. Use of Classified Information at Trial or Pretrial Hearing	380
8. Interlocutory Appeal	383

CHAPTER 10

Enforcement and Sanctions	385
A. Remedies Governed by Rule or Statute	386
1. Rule 16	386
2. Jencks	387
3. Remedies Beyond What the Rules Provide	387
B. <i>Brady</i> , Due Process, and Supervisory Powers	388
1. <i>Brady</i>	388
2. Due Process and Supervisory Powers	391
a. Government misconduct that “shocks the conscience.”	391

b. Government misconduct and supervisory powers.	392
c. Sanctioning the defendant.	392
C. Methods of Enforcement and Sanctions	394
1. Remedial Orders	394
2. Punitive Sanctions	397
a. Striking or excluding evidence.	398
b. Punitive jury instruction.	399
c. Dismissal.	400
D. Contempt	403

CHAPTER 11

Local Practice in U.S. District Courts	405
A. <i>Brady</i> Information	407
B. Criminal Rule 16 Material	411
C. Witness Statements	413
D. Notices of Defenses	414
1. Insanity	415
2. Alibi	415
3. Public Authority	415
E. Rule 404(b) Evidence	415
F. Discovery for Pretrial Suppression Litigation	416
G. Witness Lists	417
H. Exhibit Lists	417
I. Recordkeeping	418
J. Sentencing Discovery	418
K. Protective Orders	419
L. Preservation of Notes and Other Materials	419
M. Duty to Supplement	419
N. Sanctions	420
O. Other Noteworthy Procedures	420

CHAPTER 12

Reform Proposals	423
A. Pretrial Disclosure of All Exculpatory Information	424
B. Open-File Discovery	428
C. Expanded Third-Party Discovery	431
D. Jencks Act Timing	432

APPENDIX A	
Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure Addressing Discovery	435
APPENDIX B	
18 U.S.C. § 3500 The Jencks Act	453
APPENDIX C	
Websites for Local Rules or District-Wide Standing Orders Governing Criminal Discovery	455
Table of Cases	459
Index	487
Acknowledgments	497
About the Authors	499